

# THEOLOGISCHE REVUE

120. Jahrgang

– Oktober 2024 –

---

**War and Peace in the Religious Conflicts of the Long Sixteenth Century**, hg. v. Gianmarco BRAGHI / Davide DAINESE. – Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht 2023. 283 S. (Refo500 Academic Studies, 89), geb. € 80,00 ISBN: 978-3-525-57325-9

This volume brings together ten very diverse essays exploring the relationship between war and religion during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Despite the mention of peace in the title, the focus is largely on war and violence: their impact and how they were narrated and recorded, justified or condemned. The articles provide a commendably wide geographical and confessional spread, illustrating and exploring the “*longe durée* process of continuous adaptation and experimentation of the religious composition of conflicts in the political sphere,” as Braghi puts it in the afterword (263).

Following the foreword, in which Dainese sets the historiographical scene and introduces the contributions, the volume opens with an essay by *Mark Greengrass* which considers conflict through the lens of trust and loss of trust in early modern society. Religious division often resulted in “the breakdown of trust at domestic and local levels”, although such division could be mitigated by “shared ancestry and common interests” (26). Greengrass concludes that the French (and other) wars of religion need to be viewed in terms of such “broader historical changes” which were related to, but went beyond, processes of confessionalisation (36). Turning to Italy, *Angela De Benedictis* presents a series of case studies in which (armed) resistance to princely authority was given a theological justification when that authority was deemed unjust, contending that “juridical-theological language was inherent in every ‘revolt’” (66). *Ian Campbell* explores the use of scholastic approaches in the justifications of war presented by three early modern Franciscans, Alfonso de Castro, Juan Focher, and John Punch, who show the distinctiveness of Scotist positions when compared with Jesuit and Dominican arguments, and by Reformed theologians such as Samuel Rutherford, Lambert Daneau and David Pareus, focusing particularly on the relationship between eschatology and positions on just war. He argues that early modern states were not so much secularised but rather “drew sacred power into themselves” (88). Discussing the meanings attributed to terms such as *tolerantia*, *pax*, or *concordia* in early modern texts, *Jakub Koryl* suggests that their vernacular rendering results from “despondency, in a way condemning the unfavourable state of affairs”. These terms represented the “negative consequences of diversity and change, rather than the desirable way out” (101). *Thomas Müller* emphasises the need to test historiographical assumptions about the relationship between the Reformation and the so-called Peasants’ War (which in my opinion might be better rendered in English “farmers’ uprisings”) against “credible records and other historical sources” (132) and outlines areas which still need research, such as those villages which refused to become involved. Focussing on Huldrych Zwingli’s wife Anna Reinhart and Heinrich Bullinger’s wife Anna Adlischwyler, *Rebecca*

*Giselbrecht* draws attention to the impact of war on women, and indeed to women's involvement in war, revealing conflict to be "a fruitful place to examine female identity" and gender relations more generally (164). *Fabrizio D'Avenia* assesses early modern depictions of and attitudes towards the Knights of St John and their relationship to perceptions of the Holy Land. *Graeme Murdock* analyses the theological aspects of presentations of the conflict between Geneva and Savoy and the defence of the war which broke out in 1589 as "a necessary defence of the city to maintain its liberty, a fight to maintain the state's religion, and part of a greater battle for the cause of true religion everywhere" (210). *Johannes Wolfart* considers three chronicles of the two-month Lindau siege by the Swedish in early 1647, noting particularly the suspension of the normal markers of time-keeping within the town during this period. He points out the need for better understanding of the conventions of "how to chronicle a siege from within a siege" (235). Finally, *Volker Arnke* analyses the legal mechanisms by which the bi-confessional imperial city of Osnabrück not only implemented the Peace of Westphalia (1648) and the Perpetual Capitulation of Osnabrück (1650) but negotiated confessional conflict within the city, specifically the presence of the Jesuits, highlighting the importance of these strategies for the mitigation of "the severe confessional crisis of the Holy Roman Empire in the early eighteenth century" (256).

These are interesting essays, each of which represents a distinctive take on the theme. Despite Dainese's efforts to group them in the foreword, under "issues of lexicon and method", "wartime memory", "law history and political history", and "historical religious themes", the essays stand in little relationship to one another. There are some attempts to nuance the presentation of confessional difference, but I would have liked to see the authors of the volume engaging with scholarship on confessional mixing and confessional complexity, such as Carina L. JOHNSON, David M. LUEBKE, Marjorie E. PLUMMER, Jesse SPOHNHOLZ (eds): *Archeologies of Confession. Writing the German Reformation 1517–2017*, New York / Oxford 2017 (Spektrum: Publications of the German Studies Association, 16). Most of the essays include a comprehensive bibliography. The volume would have benefited from a final proof-read to remove typos such as "that" for "than" or "heroin" for "heroine".

Dainese's foreword asserts that the "main goal" of this volume is "to problematise, provoke, and arouse novel reflection" (10), and this is probably the best way to understand and to approach it. Although the collection as a whole lacks cohesion and this is not supplied by either the foreword or the afterword, there is much here that will be of interest to scholars of religion and politics across Europe in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

#### Über die Autorin:

*Charlotte Methuen*, Dr., Professorin für Kirchengeschichte an der Universität Glasgow und Adjunct Professorin am Institut für Christkatholische Theologie an der Universität Bern (charlotte.methuen@glasgow.ac.uk)